



Anti-Chinese Sentiment in Zambia and the African Continent: Comparative Coverage of the Phenomenon by Zambian, Chinese, and South African Newspapers

Young Joon Lim

E.W. Scripps School of Journalism
Ohio University

ABSTRACT

Comparative analysis on coverage of anti-Chinese sentiment in *Times of Zambia*, *China Daily*, *People's Daily* and *Business Day* of South Africa, based on theoretical backgrounds of the CNN effect, nationalism and agenda setting, identifies that the coverage of anti-Chinese sentiment in Africa illustrates the role of the press in promoting national interests. However, the African newspapers played instructive roles whereas the Chinese newspapers served as agents for the Chinese government.

Keywords: anti-Chinese sentiment, Zambia, South Africa, nationalism, instructive roles, Michael Sata

1. INTRODUCTION

While the United States is preoccupied with the war on terrorism in the first decade of 21st Century, China has operated a strategic mode in conducting its successful foreign policy with Africa. China-Africa trade grew over \$100 billion in 2008 between imports and exports: Africa's natural resources – oil, copper, and timber – flowing to Chinese factories while finished goods from plastic cups to heavy machinery, flowing the other way.[1] China has become the most active foreign investor in the sub-Saharan Africa since the end of the Cold War as the United States curtailed its economic and military assistance to African countries. With the collapse of the Soviet Union, the United States no longer needed to reward its African strategic allies that were plagued by proxy wars between the two super powers, but rather focused on the reconstruction of the Eastern Europe while Africa was vanishing from the world's development map." [2]

Although Africa has been considered the most headache continent wrestling with civil war, genocide, famine, debt, and corruption on the planet from the beginning of 1990s, China as of 2010 canceled \$10 billion of debts that "African countries owed it, and offered further debt relief to 31 African states." [3] The year of 2006 was specifically commemorated as a hallmark year for China and African countries in terms of maturing China-Africa relations. At the 2006 Forum for China Africa Cooperation (FOCAC) in Beijing, Chinese President Hu Jintao announced eight pledges for Africa: (1) doubling China's 2006 assistance to Africa by 2009; (2) providing \$3 billion of preferential loans and \$12 billion of preferential buyer's credits to Africa; (3) setting up a China-Africa development fund which will reach \$5 billion; (4) building a conference center for the African Union; (5) canceling debt in the form of all the interest-free government loans; (6) opening up China's market to Africa by increasing from 190 to over 440 items with zero-tariff; (7) establishing

three to five trade and economic cooperation zones in Africa; and (8) training 15,000 African professionals. [4]

Based on political equality and mutual trust which led to such economic cooperation, China's relationship with Africa has been nothing but solid when it comes to expanding the trade volume: in 2007, China-Africa trade reached \$73 billion, and in 2008 total trade reached nearly \$107 billion, meaning that "China was acclaimed as Africa's second leading trading partner after the United States, having surpassed France." [5] China's aggressive investment in Africa has not been stalled even in the face of the global economic recession since 2008. Rather the investment range has been expanded from commodities to educational and culture exchanges, including financial advice. The \$5 billion pledge of African Development Fund established special economic zones in Zambia, Nigeria, and Angola for free trade, and built infrastructures for smooth transportation of products. [6] As the China-Africa relations are growing fruitful and moving forward, Africa has emerged as a promising destination and space for a wide variety of Chinese corporations, being recognized as the new land of economic opportunity.

President Hu's strategies for developing China-Africa relations seem to pay off. Launching his ambitious plan with Africa in 2006, Hu emphasized peace, development, and cooperation as the principles guiding China-Africa cooperation, saying, "Working together to share opportunities, meet challenges and achieve common development is the desire of all people." [7] Such mutual development strategies benefiting from each other further elicited an international organization's support that admitted China as a chiefly progressive development partner of the African continent. The World Bank then-President Robert Zoellick in 2008 said, "The World Bank is willing to take China as a partner in a joint effort to alleviate poverty in Africa." [8]



The 2008 Beijing Olympics served as a watershed for China to declare to the world that it had the capabilities of churning out the fast-growing economic outcome that has salvaged millions of its indigent people out of poverty in a short term. Such capabilities were good enough to be applied to other poor countries, so the African continent can be the most optimal beneficiary. Impressed by the unimaginable economic growth of China and its commitment to be a mutual partner with Africa after the 2006 FOCAC, African countries rich in mineral and natural resources opened their hearts and markets to the new partner, viewed as a convincing rescuer replacing the western neo-liberal politico-economic system. In addition, China was determined to exclude interference in internal affairs of any country in Africa, unlike western countries making an effort to propagate their political beliefs and notions of democracy and capitalism with internal intervention against authoritarian governing systems in Africa. China convinced African countries that it had no interest in African rulers grabbing long-term reigns, but rather in mutually beneficial cooperation in economic relations and social development for Africans. As a result, China and Africa agreed that the core of their relations would be grounded in mutual benefit, sovereign independence, non-interference and reciprocal respect. It is overt that China has won the hearts and minds of the African continent as of 2011.

2. CHINA'S DOMINANCE IN AFRICA

Every coin has two sides. The cordial period of mutual interest development for China-Africa relations between 2006 and 2011 generated not only remarkable economic development in boosting the trade volume but also a rising number of complaints about the way China does business in Africa. As the fast-growing economy, China's strategy to achieve sustainable economic growth is simple: use cheap raw materials to export manufactured goods. China explored the abandoned continent by the West after the Cold War, and it engaged in a strategic approach to mutually beneficial cooperation with Africa where a vast amount of natural resource reserves is situated. In a simple economic sense, cheap raw materials after going through a plain process of intermediating goods lead to huge returns on investment. Thus African oil and natural resources to China were the irresistible destiny to its sustainable growth, backed by the export of low-cost manufactured goods. While Africa turned out to be the paramount supplier for China's insatiable demand in natural resources and cheap energy to maintain its industrial development in the era of globalization, the initial good-will congruence of mutual benefits for both parties seems fated to fade away. Rather than incorporating modernizing manufacturing technologies into producing and exporting finished goods, Africa has been stalled in a state of stagnant development: a helpless exporter of cheap energy and natural resources. China played a negligent role in assisting Africa in terms of developing capabilities to manufacture finished goods at exorbitant costs to Africa.[9]

Such a negligent or premeditated role backfires as criticism of China has risen to the surface. For example, German ambassador to Zimbabwe Albrecht Conze accused China of exploiting African countries and people, saying that China's dealing with African countries is imbalanced and exploitative.[10] Conze also expressed his concern about China's overwhelming natural resources appetite that could jeopardize fair global trade system. He said, "Most of the agreements signed today by China will buy out the whole world's raw materials and block other countries from having access to these raw materials." [11]

While China-Africa relations were portrayed in a positive light such as a new global model for a win-win situation and purely successful economic cooperation that helped China become Africa's preferred ally, China has gained vast business opportunities across the African continent. Mining, agriculture, construction, military equipment, energy and retail businesses in Africa are partially or massively under Chinese control. The Chinese entities investing in Africa are Chinese state-owned enterprises, corporations, and private companies. Large-scale Chinese entities focus on resource extraction for oil, uranium, industrial minerals and the construction of infrastructure projects including roads, railways, dams and hydroelectric power.[12] Meanwhile, smaller-scale Chinese entities operate joint ventures with African governments such as manufacturing, wholesale and retail trade.[13]

In fact, these days the Chinese government -- whether the scale is big or small while doing business -- recognizes Africans' rising resentment toward Chinese businessmen derived from Africa's massive trade balance deficit with China, Chinese investors' unfair treatment for local employees and the import of Chinese labor taking over Africans' job.[14] For example, the English newspaper Guardian reported in 2011 that Chinese managers in Zambia killed two mine workers protesting over pay, and rebel groups in Ethiopia killed Chinese managers who were viewed as proxies of a corrupt local government.[15] Chinese businessmen's strategy of making a profit by exploiting local employees is arguably linked to making a deal with corrupt African officials and seizing "control of a huge swath of local African industries." [16] Such a strategy is now backfiring while sparking anti-Chinese sentiment in Africa.

Although the sentiment has neither triggered uprisings across the 48 sub-Saharan African countries nor received a noticeable amount of international media coverage like the Arab spring, it is worth noting that African resentment toward China's exploitation is a growing phenomenon. An explanation for it is the 2011 presidential election in Zambia. On September 23, Zambia, in which China's significant copper mining investment is made, elected the fifth president, Michael Sata, who made a point of campaigning against Chinese investors abusing Zambian mining workers. Sata, known as anti-Chinese movement politician, failed to win the two previous presidential elections in 2006 and 2008. Since 2006 Sata's campaigning strategies had been consistent:



denouncing Chinese businessmen in Zambia for “bringing their own people to push wheelbarrows instead of hiring local people” and identifying them as “profiteers not investors.”[17] With the trend of the Zambians’ resentment toward China and Chinese investors growing, Sata finally took the reigns, even though China has officially opposed Sata since 2006. China in 2006 announced that if Sata were elected to be Zambian president, China would pull all investments out of Zambia and cut diplomatic ties. [18]

Given China’s powerful influence on people in Africa and the entire African economy, the Zambian election result raises two questions of whether this is a tipping point of anti-Chinese movement in Africa at large, and how the Chinese and their government have taken the election result in terms of operating further investment in Africa in response to China-Africa relations. Thus, this exploratory study focuses on how the new Zambian president serves as a poster child for anti-Chinese movement in the African continent and how the Chinese government has changed or will change its industrial expansion strategy in Africa. However, this study is not about the success of anti-Chinese movement in Africa. Rather this study is more concerned about how -- after Sata’s inauguration -- Zambia and China altered the strategies of Chinese investment and business operation in the African continent. This study uses the press as examples of the directive of altering or reestablishing China-Africa relations.

3. METHODOLOGY

This study examines newspaper coverage of China’s influential relationship with Africa by focusing on the new relations between China and Zambia with the assumption that Sata’s victory would motivate changes of China’s economic and foreign policy in favor of African countries. By examining the coverage of Sata’s administration related to China’s response to anti-Chinese movement in Zambia, this study selected three newspapers, one from Zambia and the others from China: the Times of Zambia, the China Daily and People’s Daily. Analyzing news coverage from the Zambian president’s inauguration on September 23, 2011, this study chose to examine the 100 days of coverage between September 23 and December 31 of 2011, in order to capture not only any significant changes of Chinese treatment toward African employees but also immediate spillover effects of anti-Chinese sentiment on China-Zambia relations. In addition, South African newspaper, the Business Day was added for this study to further investigate China-Africa relations after the Zambian election.

The four newspapers were selected because of their representative status in the countries and the African continent. The Times of Zambia as one of the two state-run newspapers with the Daily Mail in Zambia recently launched its online in English, explaining Zambia’s official policies.[19] The Business Day as South Africa’s first mainstream English-language business daily runs broader stories about African financial markets, rather than South

African corporate stories.[20] And the two Chinese newspapers, the China Daily and the People’s Daily had to be selected together because of the relatively smaller number of articles than the African newspapers (Xinhua articles about Zambia and Africa published in both newspapers were counted as each newspaper’s articles). The two Chinese newspapers are known as faithfully reflecting China’s foreign policies and national interest.[21]

The actual news stories of the Times of Zambia and the Business Day were retrieved from a keyword search of the LexisNexis database. Stories of the People’s Daily and China Daily were downloaded from their website archives as they were not available on any database. Using the keyword “China” for the two African newspapers during the period, the search yielded a total of 153 news articles – 88 articles from the Times of Zambia and 65 articles from the Business Day. In contrast, using the keyword “Zambia” for the Chinese newspapers, the People’s Daily produced seven articles and 10 articles were retrieved from the China Daily’s web search. Since this study aims to analyze news coverage of China-Africa relations after the new Zambian president’s anti-Chinese tendency surfaced, news articles as well as commentary such as editorials, columns, and op-ed were included for the analysis. Commentary about China-Africa relations with the result of the Zambian presidential election was more privileged over news articles in this study because commentary tends to instruct how the two countries pursue or rebuild a new relationship from a view of economic and political strategy. In other words, it is believed that newspapers of each country produced a certain volume of commentary that directed the two governments to find a way of resolving the past and on-going conflict, in addition to developing China-Africa relations, which were at the crossroads of anti- or pro-Chinese atmosphere in Africa.

After a total of 170 articles were collected, 47 of 88 articles from the Times of Zambia had to be eliminated because they were daily reports about prices of copper and other raw materials in international and Chinese markets. In a similar way, 31 of 65 articles of Business Day were abandoned because of routine raw material price coverage. The two Chinese newspapers’ 17 articles focused on coverage of China’s relationships with Zambia and Africa. Hence, 92 articles were analyzed in a form of qualitative textual analysis that focuses on extracting the most important themes from the data and considering when, why and how they appear.[22] Interpretation based on the data analysis was also added.

4. THEORIES

The analysis of news articles, including commentary, aims to reveal how the phenomenon of anti-Chinese sentiment in Zambia and the African continent was reflected in different newspapers from Chinese and African perspectives. Through regular news articles and commentary, the press would frame the sentiment as either a “tempest in a teapot” event or a “sailing close to the wind” event. As the



CNN effect theory explains, the media or press may alternately or simultaneously serve as a policy agenda-setting agent, an impediment to the achievement of desired policy goals, and an accelerant to policy decision-making.[23] These newspapers would instruct ways of how Zambia and China and other African countries strategize China-Africa relations after the Zambian election, which proved the increasing resentment toward China in the African continent. The relations are getting complicated because China's superior influence on capitalizing on African raw materials and energy sources invites criticisms and checks from western countries accusing China of exploiting Africans. China is diplomatically located in a place where African and western countries begin to underscore the greedy profits Chinese businessmen are making in exchange for Africans' sacrifice. The Chinese newspapers through their news articles and commentary would enlighten the Chinese government if its foreign policy toward Africa needed to be altered as the anti-Chinese sentiment seemed to be on the verge of explosion.

As the CNN effect theory suggests, the press can dictate what is on the foreign policy agenda. To some degree, China and Zambia's foreign policy toward each other in terms of business partnership and political movement against exploitation and unbalanced trade outcomes would clearly become a public issue if newspapers provided accurate information to the governments and the public. The coverage of anti-Chinese movement during the presidential campaign and the new Zambian president's animosity would send a signal to Chinese officials who are encouraged to alter China's foreign policy in Africa. On the other hand, newspapers in Africa would construct the anti-Chinese movement as a temporary fad or a pan-African movement. The press has an enticing capability of either fueling the anti-Chinese feelings of Africans or calming the feelings down with advice urging solid China-Africa relations. When these newspapers flood commentary and news articles about China-Africa relations in the era of anti-Chinese sentiment, policymakers have no choice but to reconsider or change the current foreign policy. Thus the CNN effect theory despite the opposite argument that government's foreign policy drives press coverage (propaganda model) explains how the four newspapers instructed the governments to deal with anti-Chinese sentiment in Africa.

When the press runs news stories, journalistic principles of objectivity, fairness and accuracy offer guidelines for press coverage. However, editorial commentary in newspapers rests on the concept of nationalism. Nationalism refers to a country's superior political ideology that is spontaneously used to protect a homeland from other countries' intentional cruelty; it is intimately intertwined with identification of culture and societal order. Press commentary tends to reflect the attitude that the members of a country want to take actions seeking self-determination. Press commentary particularly editorials and columns based on nationalism would offer narratives to

its readers in response to anti-Chinese sentiment in term of concepts about diplomatic relationship and national identity.

A role of the press is to tell readers what to think about, according to the agenda-setting theory. The four newspapers would tell and guide the Chinese and Africans about how to respond to the phenomenon of anti-Chinese movement. As Tomas Jefferson noted, "The press is the best instrument for enlightening the mind of man, and improving him as a rational, moral and social being," the newspapers would make efforts to play the directive role for China-Africa relations.[24] Making the anti-Chinese phenomenon salient with coverage, the newspapers would emphasize new activities or attitudes toward the issue by suggesting that the governments think about coming up with better or altered policies to prepare a new stage of China-Africa relations. Hence in a curiosity of how the four newspapers covered anti-Chinese sentiment in Zambia and Africa, and what directives they made for people and governments, this study rests on theoretical backgrounds of the CNN effect, nationalism and agenda setting.

China in the Times of Zambia

Zambia's economic success depends on its copper industry in which China invested more than \$400 million in 2010. While operating the copper mining business, Chinese employers angered Zambian employees with low salaries and lack of safety measures. Although the Chinese management knew that extracting copper without face masks, safety boots, and protective uniforms generates health hazard, workers' safety was not the first priority for the business. Worse, such Chinese-run mines caused another conflict with local community members who suffered from contaminated water sources. Tensions between Chinese businessmen and Zambians were grounded in the profit-driven operation that is unlikely to privilege human rights and safety over money. In fact, some corrupt Zambian officials had no willingness to protect its citizens from Chinese managers who bragged that they "could get away with anything because they were in the Zambian government's good books." The pent-up emotions against Chinese businessmen surfaced when two Chinese managers opened fire on a group of employees protesting poor working conditions in 2010; the shooting injured 13 Zambian miners. As anti-Chinese sentiment grew and developed to anti-Chinese movement, then-presidential candidate Michael Sata said on a campaign rally, "Zambia has become a province of China, and the Chinese are the most unpopular people in the country because no one trusts them." Sata concluded his campaign, saying, "The Chinaman is coming just to invade and exploit Africa." With his campaign strategy keeping up with the wave of anti-Chinese movement, Sata was elected to be Zambia's fifth president in September 2011.

Did his presidency refer to a prelude to spreading anti-Chinese movement in Africa at large? If so or not, how did the Times of Zambia make suggestions for the Sata



administration in developing national interest? The newspaper provided instructions and suggestions to the new government and Chinese investors on how they should deal with the rising phenomenon of anti-Chinese sentiment in Zambia and Africa. Vigorously instructing and suggesting the new president and his administration, the Times also pointed out that Zambia should build even stronger cooperation with China. The newspaper guided President Sata in ways that gave direct to indirect instructions through news articles and commentary.

The newspaper reported on its September 23, 2011 edition, "Michael Sata is the new president of Zambia." Four days later, the Times ran its first editorial about Sata's policy toward China. While downplaying Sata's anti-Chinese campaign as the past, the editorial emphasized that the new government has to embrace Chinese investments, which benefit both Zambia and China. It also described China as the world's biggest foreign holder of U.S. government debt and the world's largest consumer of raw materials. The editorial insisted: "It is important to appreciate that China is the world's largest consumer of copper, whose exports constitute the largest portion of Zambia's foreign earnings." The editorial expressed its concern with Sata's hostility toward the Chinese investors that could deteriorate Zambia's economic stability. However, it also in return demanded that the Chinese businessmen abide by local laws and have better understandings of local culture, and the Chinese government widen its investment for local job creation. The overall tone of the editorial epitomized the growing worries about Sata's hostility against China by suggesting that such tendency would not help Zambia's economic growth.

The Zambian textile industry used to be one of the Chinese business interests. But now there are dozens of closed Zambia-China textile factories across the country. The Times reported in October that while President Sata called on China to revive the textile industry, he also intimidated the Chinese government, saying, "Nothing impossible in reviving the textile industry and that better partners should be sought in South Korea if the Chinese were no longer interested." After the president's remark, the Times wrote another editorial in the same month, headlined with "Gov't Should Welcome Chinese Investment But Ensure that they Respect Local Labour Laws." The editorial presented an image of China's dominant economic power in the world. It noted that the United States and the Euro Zone strive to improve economic cooperation with China holding \$3.2 trillion in foreign reserves, so the Sata's administration need to "resolve to cement ties with China ... as the new administration sets in motion an ambitious economic development blueprint espoused in the manifesto." The Times maneuvered the same pattern for editorial related to Zambia-China relations. First, it sends compelling messages to Sata to actively embrace economic cooperation with China, and then soft messages to China to respect local laws, asking, "Chinese investors acquaint themselves with Zambian laws." This editorial

concluded that Zambia needed to hold fast on Chinese investment.

The Times presented a report from Human Rights Watch, titled You'll be fired if you refuse: Labour abuses in Zambia's Chinese State-owned copper mines on its November 9 edition. The report documented labor abuse cases by Chinese-run mines in Zambia. The report argued that the Chinese-run companies and the Chinese embassy should make an effort to follow Zambian labor laws and regulations by listening to the workers' complaints about abusive health and safety standards, long labor hours, and anti-union activities. It also urged the new government to adopt the necessary measures to enforce Zambia's labor laws on Chinese investors. In the same article, the Times also presented a statement issued by the Chinese Embassy in Zambia. The statement dispelled the report, stating, "Chinese companies have always been closely following the local laws and regulations and have actively undertaken their social responsibilities."

China's investment pledges for Zambia's infrastructure projects were frequently shown in the Times. Throughout 2011, China invested \$2 billion in Zambia. About a dozen of news articles were of specific figures on a variety of development projects such as constructions of new stadiums, roads and railways. The newspaper quoted a Chinese diplomat saying, "The \$ 2 billion worth of Chinese investment in Zambia thus far has somewhat benefited the country (Zambia)'s socio-economic development in among other areas employment creation." The November 14 article stated that China is one of the major economic powers in the world and no developing country such as Zambia could loosen ties with it, so Sata finally "has appreciated the positive contribution that Chinese investment continues to make to Zambia's economy." This was the first time for the Times to hear Sata expressing his gratitude to China.

Another editorial in November terminated any discourse against China. It referred to China as "the biggest and fastest growing economy," "the Asian giant," "an appropriate tonic for Africa's economic and social ills," and "a unique force that has positively transformed into a user-friendly ally for African countries." In the editorial, China was depicted as the savior for all African countries while the United States, the world's largest economy, was considered an anemic country "wobbling with an unsustainable budget deficit and Wall Street protests and seeking to re-adjust economic ties with China." The Times made a nonnegotiable stance that China is the only ally for the African continent, not the United States, concluding that "Therefore, African countries should not be left behind but utilise Chinese investment sustainably." This editorial was the last commentary until the last day of 2011 that instructed and reminded the Sata administration that Zambia must not antagonize China, the best ally for Zambia and African countries.

In December of 2011, several news articles in Times concentrated on reporting positive reaffirmation of Zambia-



China relations. The December 5 article summarized Sata's rise to power, which had produced a concern about uncertain and sour Zambia-China relations; however, after Chinese ambassador to Zambia Zhou Yuxiao delivered President Hu's congratulatory messages to President Sata, and Sata had an official meeting with Zhou, Sata toned down his anti-Chinese voice, assuring that both countries continue good ties, but Chinese investors adhere to labor laws. In November, Sata met with 100 Chinese investors in Zambia, and told them to forget about "the negative statements he had issued against them prior to the elections but focus on helping Zambia develop." Sata's softened attitude toward China received reciprocal treatments from the Chinese government. The Times interviewed Chinese Vice-Foreign Minister Zhai Jun who said that China would instruct its investors to abide by Zambian local requirements, and continue to "support to various sectors of the Zambian economy." The next day, China announced a multi-million dollar investment plan, including an interest free loan, to develop Zambia's economic projects which construct more government buildings, railways, and manufacturing facilities in order to fight against poverty. The Sata administration with the financial aid expects to uplift the standard of living of Zambians as well as "the spectacular advancement in the areas of manufacturing, commerce and trade, infrastructure, information and communication technologies." The last article of the year reported that the Zambian workers employed by the Chinese management would receive protective attire to avoid compromising safety standards.

Analyzing 41 articles, including commentary of the Times of Zambia, this study found that the newspaper instructed the new president not to exacerbate the relationship with China. The Times was repetitive in reminding President Sata that Zambia and African countries need to appreciate Chinese money used for the African continent's economic and social development. Overall messages from the newspaper to the new president were clear: it's not a matter of the president's personal feeling, but a matter of national interest for people in Zambia. Another interesting message was that the United States and the European Union are incapable of helping Zambia as they also vie for Chinese financial aid. It is worth noting that there was no use of such terms: "anti-Chinese movement" or "anti-Chinese sentiment" in the newspaper; rather, pro-Chinese terms such as "Zambia's best ally," "the Asian giant," and "Africa's friendly partner" were used to underscore China's economic influence. More important, the Times refused to reflect Sata's view on China. From his inauguration until the end of 2011, the newspaper was consistent with its pro-Chinese stance obviously revealed through its coverage. As a result, it is believed that the Times played a certain role in persuading Sata to alleviate his resentment in which China in return pledged more investments in Zambia in December 2011.

Zambia and Africa in China Daily and People's Daily

The Chinese government was concerned with the 2011 anti-Chinese movement and Sata's rise to power in Zambia. As mentioned before, China publicly expressed its resentment toward Sata by announcing the possibility of abolishing investment plans in Zambia if Sata were elected in 2006. After several attempts, Sata finally took office in September 2011, and the Chinese government had to establish a new policy with Zambia and the African continent. It is important to note that unlike the Times of Zambia vigorously urging President Sata to build strong cooperation with China, the two Chinese newspapers, the China Daily and People's Daily, provided few instructions and suggestions to the government and Chinese investors on how to manage China-Zambia relations; they rather highlighted China's great dedication to development for Zambia and the African continent. Neither news articles nor commentary mentioned about Chinese investors' misbehavior and anti-Chinese sentiment in Africa.

The first news article was published four days after Sata's winning. The China Daily reported that China is willing to make efforts with Zambia's new government to promote bilateral economic and trade cooperation. The newspaper also quoted Foreign Ministry spokesman Hong Lei, saying, "Major Chinese companies in Zambia have maintained the policy of not conducting fund withdrawal, production cancellation, or job cuts," so China has contributed to Zambia's economic ability to avoid the global financial crisis. The first commentary about the Zambia's new government was published in the People's Daily on September 30, 2011. The opinion piece began accusing western media of portraying Sata as an "anti-China force in Africa" and dubbing the 2011 Zambian election as "the fate of the war" against Chinese investors in Africa. It pointed out that China's faithful investments in Zambia served as the impetus for overcoming the 2008 international financial crisis which rapidly tanked raw material prices, despite the withdrawal of Western companies and capital from Zambia. It argued that since Chinese people have built highways and big buildings that created numerous jobs in Africa, Zambians as well as many African people are likely to greet Chinese businesses; however, the increasing tensions between them are derived from the similar industrial structures of China and Africa, both labor-intensive productions. Another reason for the tensions originates from Chinese misunderstanding of African people's values and cultures. For example, Chinese businessmen are taught to endure hard and long hours of work whereas African workers are accustomed to the happy-go-lucky work attitudes. The piece urged that China and Africa face up to the problems and conduct sincere operation to solve the tensions through joint efforts in establishing balanced industrial structures. Interestingly, it concluded by taking a swipe at western countries, noting: They "should curb their arrogance, abandon their zero-sum game mentality,



and work with other countries to help Africa achieve sustainable development.”

Within two months after the opinion piece, no articles about Zambia were published in the two newspapers. The next article in the People's Daily on November 24 ran a story about Zambian envoy who visited Chinese Vice President Xi Jinping in Beijing (the same topic of a similar article was in China Daily on the same day). The envoy named Kenneth Kaunda said, “Zambia and its new government will continue to promote friendship and cooperation with China.” The article stated that the sound cooperation between the two countries demonstrated friendship, and it would deepen substantial cooperation with Zambia's new government, as China will fund the Zambia-Tanzania railway project. And the last paragraph quoting the envoy manifested the newspaper's tenet to boast China's competency: “Assistance from China and fruitful cooperation have fueled the development of Zambia's economy and society.” On December 4, the China Daily repudiated Western media's accusation of China trying to colonize African countries, citing South African President Jacob Zuma, “Beijing is not colonizing the continent, but rather is a strategic partner and vast contributor to improving livelihoods” in Africa. The article mentioned that the U.S. Secretary of State Hillary Clinton while visiting Zambia in June 2011 indirectly accused China of imposing new colonialism in Africa; meanwhile, the article stressed that it is not China but western countries which seem “stuck in neocolonial perspectives that continue to paint Africa as an impoverished backwater that at most deserves sympathy and at worst contempt.” In other words, China is the only country that offers aid in agricultural technology and food security, according to Foreign Ministry spokesman Hong Lei.

Both Chinese newspapers reported the same event in which Sata and Chinese Deputy Foreign Minister Zhai Jun had a meeting in December as the Times of Zambia covered. The People's Daily wrote, “In recent years, funds and aid from China play an important role in local economic and social development” of Zambia. The minister emphasized that China and Zambia have achieved fruitful outcomes in fields of economy, trade, agriculture, mining and infrastructure construction in response to Sata who said that Zambia is to be a continuous development partner in a wide range of industries. The same pledge for sound cooperation continued when the December 15 edition of People's Daily reported another meeting between an official of the Communist Party of China and Zambian Vice President Guy Scott. They vowed joint efforts to “boost sustained and healthy development of bilateral ties.”

Compared to the number of articles of the Times of Zambia, the two Chinese newspapers relatively produced fewer articles about Zambia-Africa relations. Analyzing them, this study found that the Chinese newspapers were less likely to carry out the directive role than the Times of Zambia. Rather they prefer to keep up with the government's expectations by using government officials as the main

source. Their reporting style can be associated with nationalism in propagating government-intended information. The coverage pattern for neither covering the anti-Chinese phenomenon nor mentioning about Zambian workers' suffering under the Chinese management in Zambia proved that the two newspapers are unable to raise voice against the Chinese national interest and the government policy toward Zambia and Africa. There is no doubt that the newspapers give up the directive role, or maybe have never had such a role.

China in Business Day

The Business Day of South Africa ran its first news article about the anti-Chinese movement three days after Sata took office. The article stated that from an African perspective, Sata's victory based on xenophobic fears of Chinese people in Africa turned out a populist tactic, given the benefit of doubt by voters. The newspaper was critical of Sata's anti-Chinese campaign, pointing out that although the election was democratically held, the elected leader's lack of vision could fail to support democracy. After the report, two big categories of the newspaper's themes were formed; among the rest of 64 articles, nearly half of the news articles and commentary were associated with criticism of the Chinese government, which pressured the South African government not to allow the Dalai Lama's visit to South Africa. And the other category was about normal business reports about Chinese companies and markets; for example, new Chinese firms opened offices in South Africa and raw material prices rose or fell.

The September 27 edition reported that Archbishop Desmond Tutu invited the Dalai Lama to his 80th birthday in South Africa on October 7, but the South African government seemed reluctant to issue a visa to the world's spiritual leader. The newspaper added that the Dalai Lama's visit would present “a diplomatic nightmare” for the government because of its close diplomatic ties with China. Another news article confirmed that the Dalai Lama was “unlikely to be granted a visa” as the pressure from China, South Africa's biggest trading partner, was obvious. Between late September and mid- October, 21 editorials and opinion letters were published, condemning China's invisible influence on the policy of the South African government which postponed the visa until the Dalai Lama canceled his trip to South Africa. An editorial noted:

China will continue to procure our raw materials regardless of such diplomatic foibles. China will continue to flood our markets with cheap, often unreliable goods. The flood of Chinese wares will continue to erode our own competitiveness and indeed continue to wipe out our own hard-won industries and jobs, regardless of the president's laughable and utterly hypocritical commitment to millions of new jobs and improved trading conditions for such industries.

The newspaper sent a final message about China to the South African government by publishing an opinion piece



on December 13. The piece argued that because China is entirely driven by self-interest and economic imperialism, South Africa would never get any preferential treatment from China and its people: "Stop trying to be nice to them." It noted that China -- whether the African continent is loyal to the country -- would eventually trade them for its national interest, regardless of what actions Africans take.

The Business Day in general criticized China's overstepping interference in South Africa's domestic policy, particularly the Dalai Lama's visa case, although the newspaper admitted that China's economic power has reached out every corner of South Africans' livelihood. Moreover, it acknowledged that the government has no choice but to consider China's dominant effects on the entire African economy when establishing foreign policy. Whereas the newspaper was not afraid of warning the government of increasing danger of China's power in South Africa and instructing it to explore alternatives to become independent from China, the reality that China is the biggest investor in Africa leads the newspaper to accept the fact that China's investment is an impetus for development of African economy.

5. CONCLUSION

The African newspapers and the Chinese newspapers did not shed light on the anti-Chinese sentiment in Africa. They were likely to decide not to set such a phenomenon as a news agenda by framing the anti-Chinese sentiment as a "tempest in a teapot" phenomenon. However, the motives were different. For the Times of Zambia, spreading anti-Chinese sentiment in Zambia was not the newspaper's interest; rather, it opposed the idea and editorialized news articles and commentary urging the new president Sata to abandon his anti-Chinese sentiment for Zambians' national interest. The Times sent persuasive messages to Sata why China is the leading country on which Zambia needs to depend for its economic development. It played a directive role in instructing the new government not to antagonize China from a reality viewpoint. Sata eventually downsized his animosity toward China, and the Chinese government reciprocally responded to Sata's new attitude with new multi-million investments in Zambia.

For the two Chinese newspapers, in contrast to the Zambian newspaper, the directive role based on the CNN effect theory was overshadowed by nationalism. The two newspapers served as agents of nationalism, providing the government-produced information about China-Zambia relations. Such information was concealed by China's one-way information flow, emphasizing China's philanthropic role in developing Africans' livelihood with no strings attached. No information about African employees' frustration from Chinese investors' mistreatment was reported as it could jeopardize China's national pride and interest. On the other hand, the South African newspaper Business Day criticized China's abusive effects on South African

government's domestic policy, and advised the government to be independent from the Chinese influence. Some of its news articles and commentary were directive, but the newspaper did not spread anti-Chinese sentiment for its main news agenda because the newspaper admitted that South Africa and the African continent's economic development is less likely to be achieved without the aid from China. Although China is a threat to Africa's national identity and diplomatic relationship from the newspaper's view, China's economic power and influence in the African continent overwhelms Business Day's effort to encourage South Africa's policy self-determination. As the coverage of anti-Chinese sentiment in Africa suggests, the press plays a directive or submissive role in promoting national interest based on reality.

REFERENCES

- [1] Xan Rice, "China's Economic Invasion of Africa," *Guardian.co.uk*, accessed March 5, 2012, <http://www.guardian.co.uk/world/2011/feb/06/chinas-economic-invasion-of-africa>
- [2] Felix Edoho, "Globalization and Marginalization of Africa: Contextualization of China--Africa Relations," *Africa Today* 58, no 1 (Fall 2011): 103-124.
- [3] Ibid., p. 104.
- [4] Kehbuma Langmia, "The secret weapon of globalization: China's activities in sub-Saharan Africa," *Journal of Third World Studies*, no 2 (Fall 2011): 41-58.
- [5] Chris Alden and Daniel Large, "China's Exceptionalism and the Challenges of Delivering Difference in Africa," *Journal of Contemporary China*, no 20 (January 2011): p.24.
- [6] Ibid.
- [7] Felix Edoho, "Globalization and Marginalization of Africa: Contextualization of China--Africa Relations" p.106.
- [8] Beijing Review, "China-Africa Seeking Equality," *Beijing Review.com*, accessed March 5, 2012, http://www.bjreview.com.cn/world/txt/2008-05/10/content_115935_2.htm
- [9] Felix Edoho, "Globalization and Marginalization of Africa: Contextualization of China--Africa Relations."
- [10] Everson Mashava, "China Exploiting Africa," *Daily News.co.zw*, accessed March 9, 2012,



<http://www.esjournals.org>

- <http://www.dailynews.co.zw/index.php/news/34-news/2768-china-exploiting-africa-germany.html>
- [11] Ibid.
- [12] Accountability and Enterprise Research Institute, "Responsible Business in Africa: Chinese Business Leaders' Perspectives on Performance and Enhancement Opportunities" (November 2009), accessed March 9, 2012, http://www.hks.harvard.edu/mrcbg/CSRI/publications/workingpaper_54_zadeketal.pdf
- [13] Ibid.
- [14] Sanou Mbaye, "Africa will not put up with a colonialist China," *Guardia.co.uk*, accessed March 9, 2012, <http://www.guardian.co.uk/commentisfree/2011/feb/07/china-exploitation-africa-industry>
- [15] Xan Rice, "China's Economic Invasion of Africa."
- [16] Sanou Mbaye, "Africa will not put up with a colonialist China."
- [17] Howard W. French, "In Africa, an Election Reveals Skepticism of Chinese Involvement," *theAtlantic.com*, accessed March 9, 2012, <http://www.theatlantic.com/international/archive/2011/09/in-africa-an-election-reveals-skepticism-of-chinese-involvement/245832/>
- [18] Malcolm Riddell, "China Debate," *chinadebate.com*, accessed March 9, 2012, <http://www.chinadebate.com/2011/10/debate-is-zambia-the-beginning-of-anti-china-sentiment-in-africa/>
- [19] Isaac Phiri, "Media in Democratic Zambia: Problems and Prospects," *Africa Today* 46, no 2 (Spring 1999): 53-66.
- [20] The press in South Africa. Accessed March 9, 2012, http://www.southafrica.info/ess_info/sa_glance/constitution/news.htm
- [21] Inside China. Accessed March 9, 2012, http://thinkingchinese.com/index.php?page_id=346
- [22] Mary C Lacity and Marius A Janson, "Understanding Qualitative Data: A Framework of Text Analysis Methods," *Journal of Management Information Systems*, no 2 (1994) 137-155.
- [23] Steven Livingston, "Clarifying the CNN effect," The Joan Shorenstein Center, (June 1997), accessed March 9, 2012, <http://tamilnation.co/media/CNNeffect.pdf>
- [24] Graham Greer, *A new introduction to journalism*. (Juta & Co. Ltd. South Africa. 1999): 22.
- [25] Mutuna Chanda, "China in Zambia: Jobs or exploitation?" *bbc.co.kr*, accessed March 9, 2012, <http://www.bbc.co.uk/news/world-africa-11898960>
- [26] Ibid.
- [27] The Associated Press, "Zambian president urged to protect workers at Chinese-owned mines," accessed March 9, 2012, <http://www.guardian.co.uk/world/2011/nov/03/zambian-president-workers-chinese-mines>
- [28] Howard W. French, "In Africa, an Election Reveals Skepticism of Chinese Involvement."
- [29] Ibid.
- [30] Bob Sianjalika, Obert Simwanza and Paston Phiri, "Sata is President," *The Times of Zambia*, Sept. 23, 2011.
- [31] Ibid.
- [32] *The Times of Zambia*, "Govt Should Re-new Relationship with China for Investment and Development," Sept. 27, 2011.
- [33] *The Times of Zambia*, "No Handouts for Soldiers," Oct. 11, 2011.
- [34] *The Times of Zambia*, "Govt Should Welcome Chinese Investment But Ensure that they Respect Local Labour Laws," Oct. 31, 2011.
- [35] Ibid.
- [36] Ibid.
- [37] *The Times of Zambia*, "Chinese Labour Abuse True - Human Rights Watch," Nov. 9, 2011.
- [38] Ibid
- [39] *The Times of Zambia*, "Workers Cry for Improved Conditions of Service," Nov. 14, 2011.
- [40] Ibid.



- [41] *The Times of Zambia*, "China-Fastest Growing Economy Worth Harnessing by Africa," Nov. 28, 2011.
- [42] Ibid.
- [43] Ibid.
- [44] Bob Sianjalika, "Gov't-China Ties-in the eyes of the envoy," *The Times of Zambia*, December 5, 2011.
- [45] Ibid.
- [46] *The Times of Zambia*, "Chinese Minister Speaks Out," Dec. 12, 2011.
- [47] Chila Namaiko, "Govt, China Ink Two Big Deals," *The Times of Zambia*, Dec. 13, 2011.
- [48] Ibid.
- [49] *The Times of Zambia*, "Chinese Developer Speaks Tough On Safety Standards," Dec. 26, 2011.
- [50] *The China Daily*, "China ready to further economic ties with Zambia's new government," Sept. 27, 2011.
- [51] Ibid.
- [52] Li Wentao, "West's Zambian election coverage shows anti-China bias," *The People's Daily*, Sept. 30, 2011.
- [53] Ibid.
- [54] Ibid.
- [55] Ibid.
- [56] Ibid.
- [57] *The People's Daily*, "Chinese VP meets with Zambia's first president to discuss mutual cooperation," Nov. 25, 2011.
- [58] Ibid.
- [59] Ibid.
- [60] Hu Yian, "China has no colonial designs on Africa," *The China Daily*, Dec.9, 2011.
- [61] Ibid.
- [62] Ibid.
- [63] *The People's Daily*, "Zambia President calls for continuous cooperation with China," Dec. 13, 2011.
- [64] Ibid.
- [65] *The People's Daily*, "Senior Chinese official pledges closer ties with Zambia," Dec. 15, 2011.
- [66] Michael Biberauer, "Lack of trust is the sand in world's economic cogs," *Business Day*, Sept. 26, 2011.
- [67] Ibid.
- [68] Loyiso Langeni, "SA denies China pressure on Dalai Lama," *Business Day*, Sept. 27, 2011.
- [69] Ibid.
- [70] Loyiso Langen, "Dalai Lama unlikely to get visa to enter SA," *Business Day*, Sept. 30, 2011.
- [71] Michael Roshlot, "SA's bootlicking politics not pretty," *Business Day*, Oct. 5, 2011.
- [72] Ewan Middlemiss, "Self-interested China," *Business Day*, Dec. 13, 2011.
- [73] Ibid.